

GERMAN VILLAGE COMMISSION MINUTES

Wednesday, February 6, 2018
4:00 p.m.

German Village Meeting Haus – 588 S. Third Street

Note: The Historic Preservation Office is tentatively scheduled to move to 111 N. Front Street in late-March 2018. Following the move, all Business Meeting and Hearings will be located at that address. Hearing room(s) to be determined.

Commissioners Present: Charissa W. Durst, Jeff Ferriell, Anthony Hartke (arrived 4:03 p.m. - Public Forum/AEP), Karen McCoy, Mark Ours (arrived 4:06 p.m. - Public Forum/St. Mary's) James Panzer, Ned Thiell

Commissioners Absent:

City Staff Present: Connie Torbeck

German Village Society Staff Present: Nancy Kotting

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 4:02 p.m. (Jay Panzer)
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 p.m. (Noon), Tuesday, February 27, 2018 – 50 W. Gay Street, 1st Floor, Conference Room A.
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – 4:00 p.m., Tuesday, March 6, 2018 – 588 South Third Street
- IV. SWEARING IN OF STAFF
- V. INTRODUCTION OF COMMISSIONERS PRESENT
- VI. APPROVAL OF MINUTES, Wednesday, January 3, 2017
MOTION: Ferriell/Thiell (6-0-0) APPROVED
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS – The German Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items, as listed, (see below), and enters them into the formal record. Abstentions (if any) are shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.
MOTION: Ferriell/McCoy (6-0-0) APPROVED
- VIII. PUBLIC FORUM
 - St. Mary Catholic Church – 684 S Third Street / Fr. Lutz and Bryan Hamilton of The Hamilton Group Ohio *A temporary driveway from Third Street, between the rectory and the school, was approved January 3, 2017, to provide access to school and church events during rehabilitation of the church, with Applicant to return in one (1) year to provide an update on the project. The temporary driveway was not constructed. A temporary chain link fence and sign that were staff approved January 17, 2017 were installed.*
 - Fr. Lutz and Bryan Hamilton gave a brief update on the rehabilitation project, resulting from a lighting strike to the building as well as general fatigue.



Work is ongoing every day. Steel beams will be embedded and hidden to strengthen the walls. A blessing and signing of the beams will take place on February 16, 17, and 18. The chain link fence may need to be renewed for another year. Stained glass windows will be removed and repaired.

Some historic interior architectural features that were previously in storage, such as a pulpit, will be restored and reinstalled. Ceiling paintings will be done on canvas and then placed on the ceiling. Completion of the restoration project is tentatively expected between Christmas 2018 and Easter 2019. Meleca Architects expects to submit an application for review by the German Village Commission within a couple of months

- German Village Society
AEP – Replacement Poles to be Core-Ten poles that are pre-rusted

Nancy Kotting, Preservation Advocate, German Village Society, provided a brief update on the installation of new poles within the German Village Historic District. During a summer 2018 project, twenty-seven new poles will be installed along Jaeger Street, from Whittier Street to just north of Beck Street. AEP contacted the Society for input on the color of the new poles. AEP noted that painted poles would not be maintained by AEP as paint chipped or need renewed. At the suggestion of Randy Black, City of Columbus Historic Preservation Officer, the pre-rusted “color” was chosen. The poles are on order, but no exact installation is known. Ms. Kotting stated her appreciation to AEP for including the Society in their process.

IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

HOLDOVERS

1. 18-1-12

688 Mohawk Street

Donald Thibaut (Applicant/Owner)

Following presentation of the staff report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

In the absence of the Applicant, continue Application 18-1-12, 688 Mohawk Street, to retain an existing greenhouse, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the Tuesday, March 6, 2018 German Village Commission agenda.

MOTION: Panzer/McCoy (7-0-0) CONTINUED

2. 18-2-7

228 East Beck Street

City of Columbus Recreation and Parks Dept. & German Village Garten Club (Applicants)

City of Columbus (Owner)

Prior to review of Application # 18-2-7, Commissioner Ours noted the need to recuse himself from the proceedings, and exited the hearing room.

Following presentation by the Applicants, and additional discussion, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application 18-2-7, 228 East Beck Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Build New Pergola

- Remove the existing, ca. 2002 pergola, per the submitted photographs.
- Build new pergola structure on an existing, concrete pad, with expanded footprint, per the submitted renderings.
- Roof system to be metal, snap-on-seam SS10. Color to be “Dove Grey.”
- Ceiling system to be wood.
- Stain color to be “Ebony.”
- Final drawings to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

MOTION: Thiell/Durst (6-0-1[Ours-recused]) APPROVED

3. 17-11-29a

503 South Third Street

Jon Halverstadt (Applicant/Owner)

Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application 17-11-29a, 503 South Third Street, as amended, with all clarifications, as noted:

Demolition

- Demolish the existing, ca. 1935, frame and concrete block garage.

Construct New Garage

- Construct a new, attached, garage.
- New, frame garage to have smooth, horizontal bevel lapped siding with 4" exposure.
- Wood trim to be per the submitted drawings.
- Final paint colors to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Foundation to be split face concrete block.
- Single overhead garage door to be wood, or steel with wood overlay. Final drawing and/or cut sheet to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- Garage service door to be wood. Cut sheet to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- Roofing material to be EPDM rubber with metal coping. Color to be "Sandstone."
- Gutters to be ogee (k-style) to match existing on house, with 3" round downspout, painted to match trim.
- Final drawings to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Curb Cuts & Landscape

- Retain the existing, ca. 1930s, stone curb cut along East Blenkner Street.
- Remove existing curb cut and concrete driveway along South Third Street.
- Future patio and green space on north side of existing house to return for review and approval.

MOTION: Ours/Thiell (7-0-0) APPROVED

VARIANCES

4. 18-2-8

1034 Jaeger Street

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

John Kuijper & Edward Liang (Owners)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, Chairperson Hartke called all those wishing to speak in order of speaker slip received.

<u>Name, Address, Affiliation:</u>	<u>Issues/ Comments:</u>
Zachary Sugarman 1042 Jaeger Street	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Asked for clarification as to why the requested variances are required. • Is not aware of any other nearby carriage houses being used as a residence. • Concerned about parking if the house reverts back to a two-family dwelling, with potentially three dwellings, possibly rental units, on the same lot.

Following the public speaker(s), further presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, the following motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

At the request of the Applicant, continue Application 18-2-8, 1034 Jaeger Street, for construction of a new carriage house with second floor bed/bath/kitchen, to allow time for the Applicant to modify the design of the proposed carriage house, to exclude a kitchen, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the Tuesday, 6, 2018 German Village Commission agenda for further review.

MOTION: Panzer/Ours (7-0-0) CONTINUED

5. 18-2-9

1034 Jaeger Street

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

John Kuijper & Edward Liang (Owners)

Following presentation by the Applicant, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Continue Application 18-2-9, 1034 Jaeger Street, for variances related to construction of a new carriage house with second floor bed/bath/kitchen, to allow time for the Applicant to research the required variances for a carriage house with bed/bath only, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the Tuesday, March 6, 2018 German Village Commission agenda for further review.

MOTION: Ours/Panzer (7-0-0) CONTINUED

6. 18-2-10

214 East Sycamore Street (aka 223 Lear Street)

William Hugus Architects, Ltd. (Applicant)

William Mains & Brian Smith (Owners)

Prior to review of Application # 18-2-10, Commissioner Panzer noted the need to recuse himself from the proceedings. Following the presentation by the Applicant, Chairperson Hartke called all those wishing to speak in order of speaker slip received.

<u>Name, Address, Affiliation:</u>	<u>Issues/ Comments:</u>
Cathy Hunzinger 228 Lear Street Neighboring property owner	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Concerned that the design of the building is not known. Asked for clarification about the submitted site plan.
Tyler Mason 626 South Fifth Street Neighboring property owner	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Was more excited when it was proposed as a home rather than a garage, because his windows face Lear Street. Seems odd to have parking space for another property under someone else's potential home. Backing in and out onto Lear Street is difficult.
Pat Bates 625 South Fifth Street Neighboring property owner	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Has concerns about water runoff and green space that will be covered. Brick is okay, but concrete under the brick is a problem. Wants to make sure her basement stays dry.
Amy Weis 632 South Fifth Street Neighboring property owner	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Also has concerns about runoff. Submitted photos of Fifth and Lear street to show effect on aesthetics. Concerns about a garage so close to the street. Concerns about use as an Air BNB or rental in the future. Does not think of Lear Street as an alley. Would like it to look residential. Concerned about the number of parking spaces

	provided in the carriage house.
Michele Whitaker 640 S. Fifth Street Neighboring property owner	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Concerned about the aesthetics of a carriage house. • Concerned about traffic and parking. • Concerns about a carriage house blocking the light of adjacent properties. • Would like to see the site cleaned up. • Would not be in favor of a second story porch.
Jay Panzer 220 East Sycamore Neighboring property owner	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Supports the proposed variances • Read a statement into the record and provided a copy to staff. Statement is on file at the Historic Preservation Office. • The proposed project provides off-street parking for two residences, but does not sacrifice green space or diminish on-street parking or require a curb cut.

Following the public speaker(s), further presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, the following motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Upon review of Application #18-2-10, 214 East Sycamore Street (aka 223 Lear Street), the German Village Commission recommends approval of the proposed variances, as submitted:

Request for Variance Recommendation

1. 3332.38 Private Garage (F1): To allow a private garage to exceed 720 sf maximum to 1,120 sf.
2. 3312.49 Required Parking: To provide two (2) off street parking spaces for 214 E. Sycamore Street on the 223 E. Lear Street site.

MOTION: Ours/McCoy (6-0-1[Panzer-recused]) APPROVAL RECOMMENDED

7. 18-2-11

750 Mohawk Street/754 Mohawk Street/755 Macon Alley

William Hugus Architects, Ltd. (Applicant)

Anthony Digiandomenico (754 Mohawk/755 Macon) & William Hugus (750 Mohawk) (Owners)

Following presentation by the Applicants, and additional discussion and review, the following motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Upon review of Application #18-2-11, 750 Mohawk Street/754 Mohawk Street/755 Macon Alley, the German Village Commission recommends approval of the proposed variances, as submitted:

Request for Variance Recommendation

Lot A: (750 Mohawk)

- 3312.49 Required Parking: to only provide 1 parking space (garage) and convert the existing stacked parking space to a driveway and maneuvering area for Lot B and Lot C
- 3312.13 Driveway: to conform the existing driveway that is 9' wide instead of 10'.
- 3312.43 Surface for Parking: to conform the existing driveway that is not composed entirely of a hard surface
- 3332.26 Minimum Side Yard: Existing North side yard is 2.5', less than the required 3'

Lot B: (754 Mohawk)

- 3312.25 Maneuvering: to maneuver across property lines to park on the parking pad and in the garage space on Lot C.
- 3312.49 Required Parking: to provide 1 off-street parking space on site and 1 parking space on Lot C
- 3332.26 Minimum Side Yard: Existing South side yard is 1.2', less than the required 3'

Lot C: (755 Macon Alley)

- 3312.25 Maneuvering: to maneuver across property lines to park in the north garage space (we realize this space will be for Lot B, however in the future lot C could possibly change up the agreement and start using the garage instead of Lot B).
- 3312.43 Surface for Parking: to conform the existing driveway that is not composed entirely of a hard surface
- 3332.19 Frontage: to conform the existing house that fronts on an alley instead of a public street

MOTION: Ferriell/Durst (7-0-0) APPROVAL RECOMMENDED

REHEARING

8. 18-1-15

179 East Deshler Avenue

William Hugus Architects (Applicant)

Chip Burke (Owner)

Following presentation of the staff report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

In the absence of, and at the request of the Applicant, continue Application 18-1-15, 179 East Deshler Avenue, for a Rehearing regarding installation of aluminum-clad windows, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the Tuesday, March 6, 2018 German Village Commission agenda for further review.

Note: This is the second continuance in the absence of the Applicants.

MOTION: Panzer/Durst (6-0-1[Ours-recused]) CONTINUED

9. 18-2-12

207 East Deshler Avenue

Ziad Shaheen (Applicant/Owner)

Following presentation of the staff report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

In the absence of, and at the request of the Applicant, continue Application 18-2-12, 207 East Deshler Avenue, for a Rehearing regarding privacy fence paint color, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the Tuesday, March 6, 2018 German Village Commission agenda for further review.

MOTION: Panzer/McCoy (6-0-1[Ours-recused]) CONTINUED

NEW APPLICATIONS

10. 18-2-13

633 Brust Street

Pro Exterior by APCO (Applicant)

Cody & Whitney Fitch (Owners)

Following presentation of the staff report, and additional discussion, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application 18-2-13, 633 Brust Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install HardieBoard Siding

- Remove all existing, Masonite composite siding and trim on all elevations.
- Install new James Hardie, smooth, fiber cement lap siding with 4" exposure, per the submitted product cut sheet.
- Siding to be installed with a ¾" underlayment, to provide stability.
- Install new, James Hardie, fiber cement window and door trim, corner boards, soffit, and fascia.
- Siding color to be "Iron Grey;" - Trim to be "Navajo Beige."

Install New Windows

- Remove all existing windows and frames on the ca. 1990, two-story frame house.
- Install new, Marvin Ultimate Next Generation 2.0, aluminum-clad wood, one-over-one, double-hung sash windows, per the submitted drawings.

- Exterior color to be “Ebony.”

Install New Gutters/Downspouts

- Remove all existing, metal, ogee (k-style) gutters on the house and new, 5”, metal, ogee (k-style) gutters.
- Install new, corrugated metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

Install New Door & Transom

- Remove the existing, metal, six-panel door and transom at the main entrance on the left side/south elevation.
- Install a new, 8 ft. Provia, full frame, Signet, fiberglass door, per the submitted product cut sheet.
- New door to be Model # 440, ¾ lite with single panel.

Install New Door/Rear Elevation

- Remove the existing French door on the rear elevation.
- Install a new, Marvin Ultimate, aluminum-clad wood, inswing French door in same location, per the submitted product cut sheet.
- Exterior color to be “Ebony.”

MOTION: Panzer/Ours (7-0-0) APPROVED

11. 18-2-14

825 South Fifth Street

Urbanorder Architecture (Applicant)

Mary Wilson & Robin Strohm (Owners)

Following presentation of the staff report, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application 18-2-14, 825 South Fifth Street, as modified, with all clarifications, as noted:

Build New Screened Porch

- Construct a new, 8’ x 16’ screened porch at the rear of the existing house, per the submitted site plan.
- Wood, box columns to include 3” crowns and ¾” base trim.
- Fishscale shingles in the closed cornices of the side elevations to match existing shingles in the front gable of the house.
- Asphalt roofing shingles to match existing asphalt shingles on house.
- Foundation to be plain-faced concrete block.
- Final drawings to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

MOTION: Ours/Panzer (7-0-0) APPROVED

12. 18-2-15

925 Mohawk Street

Klaus T. Gauer (Applicant)

Sean & Sarah Evans (Owners)

Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application 18-2-15, 925 Mohawk Street, as modified, with all clarifications, as noted:

New Addition

- Construct a new, frame, second-story addition, above the existing, one-story, frame addition located in the rear ell (southwest corner).
- Exterior cladding to be wood, drop siding to match existing siding on the existing, one-story addition.
- All corner boards, fascia, soffit, and window trim to match existing trim on existing one-story addition.
- One new window opening on the south elevation to be all wood, Lincoln, one-over-one, double-hung sash. Window size and trim to match existing window on existing, one-story addition. Cut sheet to be submitted to

Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

- Flat roof to have EPDM roofing.
- Gutters to be 5” ogee (k-style).
- Paint colors to match existing colors on existing, one-story addition.
- Final drawings to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

MOTION: Ours/Panzer (6-1[Ours-against]-0) APPROVED

A brief break was taken from 6:04 – 6:10 p.m.

13. 18-2-16

293 East Beck Street

CJ Andrews/mode architects (Applicant)

Judson & Stefanie Martt (Owners)

Prior to review of Application # 18-2-16, Commissioner Ours noted the need to recuse himself from the proceedings, and exited the hearing room.

Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application 18-2-16, 293 East Beck Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install New Standing-Seam Metal Roof / Garage

- Remove the existing, asphalt shingle roofing on the frame garage.
- Install new, standing-seam metal roofing, to match the existing, standing-seam metal roofing on the house, per the submitted section drawing. Color to be “Dark Bronze.”
- Existing copper gutters and downspout to remain.

Install New Fabric Awnings

- Install a new, fabric awning above each of the two (2) front elevation doors, per the submitted drawings and rendering.
- Awnings to have open ends with 1” square, black aluminum frame.
- Slope to match existing handrails.
- All fasteners to be inserted into mortar joints only, not into the face of the brick.

MOTION: Durst/Thiell (6-0-1[Ours-recused]) APPROVED

14. 18-2-17

172 Thurman Avenue (aka 170 Thurman Avenue)

Mark & Keriann Ours (Applicants/Owners)

Prior to review of Application #18-2-17, Commissioner Ours moved to the opposite side of the table to represent himself as the Applicant.

Approve Application 18-2-17, 172 Thurman Avenue (aka 170 Thurman Avenue), as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Tuck Point

- Check all mortar joints on all elevations walls, chimneys, and front porch columns for soundness. All sound mortar to remain in place.
- Use hand tools to remove any/all loose mortar to a depth of 3/4”.
- Moisten surface with water, and spot point as needed with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. New mortar must be softer than the masonry, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- “Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings” <http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm>.)

New Addition

- Construct new, 848 sf, rear addition, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.
- Exterior cladding to include, Boral clapboard siding with 5" exposure; cement board rain screen panel siding; and thermally modified wood siding; and Corten metal siding, per the submitted elevation drawings. Material samples were presented at the February 6, 2018 GVC hearing.
- Windows and doors to be Marvin, aluminum-clad, "Ebony" color, per the submitted product cut sheets.
- Addition to include four (4) skylights.
- Final drawings to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

MOTION: Panzer/McCoy (6-0-1[Ours-recused]) APPROVED

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

15. 18-2-18

785 City Park Avenue

Patricia Tweel (Applicant/Owner)

Prior to review of Application # 18-2-18, Chairperson Hartke noted the need to recuse himself from the proceedings, and exited the hearing room. Commissioner Panzer assumed the role of Chairperson.

New Addition

- Build new, second-story, frame addition above the existing, one-story, rear (west elevation), frame, three-season room (built 2011), per the submitted drawings.
- All materials and colors to match existing first-story addition.
- Windows to be wood, JeldWen, single-lite sash.
- Exterior cladding to be 4" lap siding, to match first-story addition.

Following presentation by the Applicant, Acting Chairperson Panzer opened the discussion, and Commission members provided comments to assist the Applicant in preparing for further review.

Commissioner Panzer:

- Noted that the Historic Review Commissions will soon be adopting approval of alternative materials for new windows.

Commissioner McCoy:

- Asked about the exterior cladding where the existing second story addition meets the new second story addition. Might be a better solution to wrap the board-and-batten to the west elevation.

Commissioner Durst:

- Suggested stepping the second story wall back on the north elevation.
- Does not have an issue with removing the existing dentils.
- Consider centering the new window on the existing second story addition over the first floor sliding doors.

Commissioner Thiell:

- Suggested bringing the north elevation wall of the second floor addition out to the same plane as the existing board-and-batten wall.
- The first floor addition extends straight back. Why not carry the massing back on the second floor? Or, perhaps move it back to the plane of the first floor wall.
- Is there a way to align the overhangs of the existing and proposed additions?

Commissioner Ours:

- Noted that there is a roof deck on the north elevation. It might be nice to have the second story wall step in from that.

NO ACTION TAKEN

16. 18-2-19

247-257 E. Livingston Avenue & Vacant Lot (Parcel #010-044326)

John Leonard/Berardi & Partners (Applicant)

Cedar Square, LLC. (Owner)

Prior to review of Application # 18-2-19, Chairperson Hartke returned to the table and resumed the role of Chairperson.

Demolition

- Demolish the existing, ca. 1920, two-story, brick, commercial building at 247-257 E. Livingston Avenue, per the submitted photographs. To be replaced by “Building A.”

New Construction / 247-257 E. Livingston Avenue & Vacant Lot (Parcel #010-044326)

- Build a new, four-story, 29 unit, residential building, with three-stories facing onto E. Livingston Avenue (north elevation), per the submitted drawings.
- Exterior cladding to include a combination of red and gray brick, and light-smooth face panel or cementitious siding.
- Windows to be wood, one-over-one, double hung sash with stone lintels and continuous stone sills.
- Some units facing onto E. Livingston Avenue to include window walls with steel guardrails.
- Adjacent surface parking lot to include 16 spaces.

New Construction / Vacant Lot (Parcel #010-044326)

- Build a new, four-story, 33 unit, residential building, with three-stories facing onto E. Livingston Avenue (north elevation), per the submitted drawings.
- Exterior cladding to include a combination of red and gray brick, and light-smooth face panel or cementitious siding.
- Windows to be wood, one-over-one, double hung sash with stone lintels and continuous stone sills.
- Some units to include window walls with steel guardrails.
- Adjacent surface parking lot to include 31 spaces.

Following the presentation by the Applicant, Chairperson Hartke called all those wishing to speak in order of speaker slip received.

<u>Name, Address, Affiliation:</u>	<u>Issues/ Comments:</u>
Nancy Kotting, Historic Preservation Advocate German Village Society	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Conveyed, at the request of the GVS board, that the GVS is establishing a response protocol that would be triggered by any newly proposed substantial infill or development within the District. The objective would be to establish constructive communication channels between GVS membership and the developers. A developer may choose to participate or not.• In regard to the proposed design, referred to the GV guideline stating “A new building should be shorter than the tallest building in the area, and higher than the shortest.” Livingston Ave is the northern marker of the District. Would be concerned with a development that did not reinforce the announcement of that boundary.

Following the public speaker(s), Chairperson Hartke opened the discussion, and Commission members provided comments to assist the Applicant in preparing for further review.

Commissioner Durst:

- Asked if there is a possible development scheme in which parking variances would not be required.

Commissioner Panzer:

- Noted that the increase in permitted areas in the north part of German Village has resulted, in part, from non-German Village residents parking in non-permitted areas of German Village and walking downtown to work.
- The City may be permitting one parking space per bedroom, but that has not been done in German Village. There may be areas where that is appropriate, such as with new high-rise apartment buildings in the core of downtown, but that is a different circumstance.
- The Commission traditionally looks at massing, materials, and details. Cannot get past the massing of this project, as currently proposed.
- Appreciates how clearly the proposal has been laid out in the materials submitted for review.
- Is disturbed by the view of “Building E” rising above the Happy Dragon building, as well as a sheer wall rising along Blenkner Street next to small cottages.
- In regard to the German Village height guideline, the Commission has sometimes said that a flat roofed structure next to a gabled structure could mitigate that requirement a bit, but does not see that working as currently proposed.
- Understands the Applicant’s view about Livingston Avenue being an edge condition, but sees the edge condition as being on the north side of the street.
- The existing structures along Livingston may currently be commercial, but they are of a residential scale. To impose a massing that is so different from those residential structures can’t help but diminish the historic character of those contributing structures. That character is what the Commission is enjoined to protect. There has to be respect for the existing historic fabric.

Commissioner McCoy:

- Need more clarification on how the parking count could work with the number of proposed residential units and a restaurant.
- Could not support the proposed density with the proposed parking.
- Is not in support of the proposed height. Understands the developers point of view that Livingston Avenue is an edge condition, but the height has been pushed back from Livingston towards the residences right behind it.
- Will need further details regarding fenestration. Would there be any solid masonry walls?
- Will be sensitive to the height and design of the south elevations facing onto German Village.

Commissioner Hartke:

- Asked for clarification regarding dedicated parking for the proposed restaurant. If the lot is blocked from S. Sixth Street, a lot of traffic would be concentrated onto Blenkner, a smaller street.
- Some residents may have no car, and some may have two cars. There should at least be parking for every resident on site. There is no on-street parking in the immediate area.
- In regard to traffic slowing down along Livingston in the future, and what is seen from the pedestrian way, the visual impact will be more important.

Commissioner Thiell:

- With 74 units proposed, there is a possibility of 148 cars. With only 54 spaces proposed, where would the other spaces come from? German Village residents will have to compete for parking spaces.
- Think the 1.5 required spaces needs to be met.
- The German Village guidelines apply to all buildings and sites out to the edge of the district.
- The interior of the district is not handled differently than along the edges.

Commissioner Ferriell:

- Appreciates how the use of color and setting the height back has been used to try to blend in with the existing buildings. Does not think the current proposal does the job. The massing is too much. It diminishes the importance of the nearby historic structures.

NO ACTION TAKEN

STAFF APPROVALS

(The following applicants are not required to attend)

- **18-2-1**

243 Jackson Street

J.T. Means & Natalie Sisto-Means (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 18-2-1, 243 Jackson Street, for renewal of expired COA # 16-12-27a (Expired: December 6, 2017), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.

Install New Guardrails

- Install new, wood guardrails on the three-sided perimeter of the porch roof walk-out on the rear elevation.
- Drawings for the new guardrails to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

Note: As the phased project proceeds, the first floor porch railings are to be changed to match the porch roof walk-out railings. A new application will be required.

Install New Window Openings

- Create two (2) new window openings on the second floor of the west elevation on the existing, non-original rear section of the house, per the submitted elevation drawings.
- New windows to be all wood (interior/exterior), one-over-one, double-hung sash with wood exterior casings to match casings on existing windows.
- Cut sheet for new wood windows to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.

Note: New window openings are being approved based on their location within the non-original section of the house.

Install Storm Door

- Install a new, full-light, aluminum storm door on the front elevation.
- Cut sheet for new storm door to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.

MOTION: Ours/Leukart (4-0-0) APPROVED

- **18-2-2**

710 South Pearl Street

Brett Molli/RCI Electrical Solutions (Applicant)

Terry & Michelle Kelley (Owner)

Approve Application #18-2-2, 710 South Pearl Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Install New Generator

- Install one (1) new 22kW, standby generator at the newly constructed single family dwelling, per the submitted product cut sheet specifications and site plan.
- New generator to be located between two (2) new AC condenser units on the north side of the structure.
Note: AC condenser locations previously approved with COA # 16-11-36b.
- Standby generator to be supplied with natural gas from house meter and supply electric to panel located in basement.

- **18-2-3**

747 City Park Avenue

Greg Eckelman & Sarah Nayeem (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #18-2-3, 747 City Park Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Install New Storm Windows

- Install new, ProVia, Town & Country Series, low profile, aluminum storm windows on all windows, as needed, per the submitted product cut sheets and specifications.
- New storm windows to be installed inside the existing window frame.
- Storm window color to be "Rustic Bronze."
- Double caulk to provide air-tight installation on top and sides. Do not caulk breather holes.

- Horizontal bar on all new storm windows to align with horizontal sash bar on existing windows.
- Storm windows to operate smoothly.

Install New Storm Door

- Install new, ProVia, full view storm doors on all doors, as needed, per the submitted product cut sheets and specifications.
- Storm door color to be “Rustic Bronze.”
- Glass to be clear.

- **18-2-4**

41 Stewart Avenue

Barbara & John Young (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #18-2-4, 41 Stewart Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Restore Stained Glass Window

- Remove existing leaded panel in wood sash, per the submitted photographs.
- Secure existing opening with wood during restoration of the window.
- Disassemble and re-lead entire panel, per the submitted specifications.
- All original glass to be repaired and retained.
- Reinstall glass into sash frame and reinstall unit into window opening.
- Install new, custom-made, exterior storm window.

- **18-2-5**

306 East Sycamore Street

Teresa J. Dalenta (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #18-2-5, 306 East Sycamore Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Exterior Painting House/Garage

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the frame portions of the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prepare all siding and wood trim on the garage for repainting.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications. Paint colors to be: Body – SW2849 “Westchester Gray”; Trim – SW7674 “Peppercorn.”
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick walls, stone window sills/lintels, stone foundation, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **18-2-6**

771 South Fifth Street

Jennifer Siegel (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #18-2-6, 771 South Fifth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the frame house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint colors to be as follows: **Body** –SW 7048 “Urbane Bronze”; **Window & Door trim and side yard porch** - SW 6222 “Riverway”; **Doors, side yard porch floor, and wood fence in side yard** - SW 7623 “Cascades”; **Window sashes and alternate for wood fence in side yard** - SW 6258 “Tricorn Black.”

X. OLD BUSINESS

XI. NEW BUSINESS

- **18-2-20**

729 Mohawk Street

Megan Heckler/Feazel Roofing (Applicant)

Laura & Mike Duffy (Owner)

Following presentation of the staff report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.

Approve Application 18-2-20, 729 Mohawk Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all slate on the main roof of the brick cottage, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color to be from the approved shingles list:

Manufacturer:

Style:

Color:

[] CertainTeed

Carriage House (dimensional)

[] Stonegate Gray

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “gray” or “Tinner's Red.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “gray” or “Tinner's Red.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

MOTION: Ours/Ferriell (6-1[Panzer-against]-0) APPROVED

- Adoption of Window Replacement Standards & Procedures & Window Staff Approval Lists**

In an effort to determine possible alternatives to all-wood window units, beginning in 2009, window test cases have been approved by the local commissions on a case-by-case basis as a method to assess the appropriateness of both the design and performance of other window materials.

The Historic Preservation Office staff, in conjunction with the five (5) City of Columbus architectural review commissions, began working on the analysis of window review procedures and standards in historic districts locally, and in cities nationwide, in 2015. To date, each commission has approved test cases in their respective districts, and the installations have been completed and reviewed.

Approved Window Lists have been prepared for All-Wood Windows and for Composite, Fiberglass, and Aluminum-Clad Wood Windows. Samples have been provided in the Historic Preservation Office and reviewed by the commissioners at their respective Business Meetings, Regular Meetings, and Chairs Meetings.

Approved Composite, Fiberglass and Aluminum-Clad Wood Window List

MANUFACTURER	SERIES	Material
Fiber Frame	2100 Series (Awning)	Fiberglass Exterior & Interior
Pella	Impervia	Fiberglass Composite Exterior & Interior
Marvin	Integrity Wood Ultrex	Fiberglass Exterior/Wood Interior
Marvin	Infinity	Fiberglass Exterior & Interior
Andersen	400 Series	Vinyl-Clad Exterior/Wood Interior
Universal	700 Series	Aluminum Exterior & Interior
JeldWen	Siteline	Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior/Wood Interior
Marvin	Ultimate-Next Generation 2.0	Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior/Wood Interior
Kolbe	Ultra Series "Sterling"	Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior/Wood Interior
Trimline	Eclipse EC300	Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior/Wood Interior
*Lincoln	Standard Double-Hung	Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior/Wood Interior
*Loewen	Standard Double-Hung	Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior/Wood Interior
*Pella	Architect Series Reserve	Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior/Wood Interior
*Quaker	Brighton LS Series	Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior/Wood Interior
*Weathershield	Premium Series 8109	Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior/Wood Interior

**Recommended for Inclusion – Not a Test Case*

1-29-2018

Approved Wood Window List

MANUFACTURER	SERIES	MATERIAL
Kolbe	Heritage	Wood Exterior/Interior
Loewen	All Wood	Wood Exterior/Interior
WeatherShield	All Wood	Wood Exterior/Interior
Marvin	Wood Ultimate	Wood Exterior/Interior
Sierra Pacific (formerly Hurd)	All Wood	Wood Exterior/Interior
Kolbe	Heritage Series	Wood Exterior/Interior
Trimline Liberty	All Wood	Wood Exterior/Interior
JeldWen	Siteline	Wood Exterior/Interior
Pella	Architect Series & Reserve	Wood Exterior/Interior
Lincoln	All Wood	Wood Exterior/Interior

*Upon final review, the Historic Preservation Office staff recommends the formal adoption of the **All-Wood Windows List** and the **Approved Composite, Fiberglass, and Aluminum-Clad Wood Windows List** (dated 1/29/18).*

Evaluation of existing window conditions will be conducted by the Historic Preservation Office staff in conjunction with the appropriate architectural review commission. The H. P. O. staff will issue the Certificate of Appropriateness for window replacement as a Staff Approval upon receipt and review of the application and assessment of the window condition(s).

All staff approved window repair and/or replacement will appear on the regular commission meeting agenda as Staff Approved items for acceptance into the permanent record in accordance with established procedures and per City Code.

Following the staff report and presentation by HPO staff, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve and adopt the Window Replacement Standards & Procedures & Window Staff Approval List, with the following clarifications.

- The vinyl-clad, Andersen 400 Series is not approved. No sample window was available for review by the Commission.
- The Fiber Frame, 2100 Series (Awning) is to be used at grade only (basement windows).
- The Marvin Integrity Wood Ultrex, the Marvin Infinity, and any other double-hung window with mitred corners, is to be for new construction only.
- The Pella Impervia is approved for steel casement replacements only, due to mitred corners.
- The Universal 700 Series is to be for steel replica casements only.
- Jamb liners on all-wood, as well as on alternative material windows, are to match the color of window exterior or be concealed with jamb liner covers.

MOTION: Ours/Panzer (7-0-0) APPROVED

XII. ADJOURNMENT

Ours/Panzer (7-0-0) ADJOURNED (8:14 p.m.)